

“Feeling the Fall: A Biblical-Theological Examination of Melancholy as an Emotional Mirror of a Fallen World”

Brian R. Hand
BJU Seminary

There is a kind of darkness that can be felt—really felt. Some people live as though already entombed. No matter where they turn, there is no path. No matter how hard the eyes strain, there is no light, only tears. Darkness rushes in, presses down. Its weight is immense, interminable, insufferable. They claw for relief as a drowning person gasps for air, but there is no rescue, no escape. They sink until their emotions give out, exhausted. They live in a darkness that swallows up light. Pleasure itself becomes a distant and distorted memory. For a while those who are so entombed can mask their failing energy and increasing lethargy of spirit. The resilient last longer than most, but nearly everyone who falls into this mist and shadow eventually succumbs to a crushing gloom.

Melancholia—on a spectrum from simple sadness through profound sadness and on through despondency to depression—marks nearly every life at some point. Counselors often have strong opinions on melancholy—at least regarding its more serious and durable forms. Some assert that it is a disease. Gary Kinnaman and Richard Jacobs assert, “Depression is not grief. It is not sadness. It is not a person feeling sorry for themselves. Rather, the serious disease known as depression strikes at the welfare of body, spirit, and soul. In other words, it affects every part of us.”¹ Others just as adamantly declare that melancholy is always—or at least nearly always—sin.² Much of the literature starts with the authors’ presuppositions, personal experiences, personality, or theological traditions and only later selects biblical evidence to warrant the cherished position. And, given the complexity of human emotions and the breadth of biblical information on these emotions, one can find adequate, if mishandled, support in Scripture for every theory on melancholy—it is entirely endogenous (disease, chemistry, or malformity), entirely spiritual, entirely circumstantial, entirely emotional, or some combination of these.

¹ *Seeking in the Dark: Getting the Facts on Depression & Finding Hope Again* (Minneapolis: Bethany House, 2006), 53. See also Zack Eswine, *Spurgeon’s Sorrows: Realistic Hope for Those Who Suffer from Depression* (Glasgow: Bell and Bain, 2014). “Contrary to what some people tell us, sadness is neither a sign of laziness nor a sin; neither negative thinking nor weakness. On the contrary, when we find ourselves impatient with sadness, we reveal our preference for folly, our resistance to wisdom, and our disregard for depth and proportion” (Eswine, 30). See also the many books written by Paul Meier, who boasts about writing two to three books every year on depression. Paul Meier, *Blue Genes: Breaking Free from the Chemical Imbalances That Affect Your Moods, Your Mind, Your Life, and Your Loved Ones* (Carol Stream, IL: Tyndale, 2005). Meier aggressively advocates the chemical theory of depression, and his books sound like an infomercial for the pharmaceutical industry as he constantly references various drugs he prescribes.

² See, for instance, Bud Calvert, *Emotional Victory: How to Deal with How You Feel* (Lancaster, CA: Striving Together Publications, 2012). Calvert dismisses endogenous (arising from internal chemical or pathogenic) causes almost entirely. In this, he follows Jay Adams and nouthetic counseling. Representative statements include: “[Jesus] was never depressed, because depression was not an option” (41); “recognizing sin as the root of depression can be difficult” (46); and “there is no person that can make me depressed. There is no circumstance that can make me depressed” (47). While these statements remain a theoretical possibility, they remain unproven assertions. And the biblical evidence to support them is extremely limited.

Each position could overstate the supporting evidence and understate the controverting evidence. Sorrow appears throughout Scripture, and the biblical evidence seems to run the gamut of mild sorrow (the rich young ruler in Matthew 22, whose sorrow was induced by personal sin) to depression (Job and David among others, whose sorrow was induced by circumstance, sickness, or Satan), and it does so without ever using modern, scientific designations.³ A biblical-theological examination of melancholy should help us nuance our understanding of human sadness, and it shows us that melancholy is an emotional reflection of a fallen world.

Problems in Studying Melancholy

In any line of inquiry, the mind naturally runs to the instances *par excellence*. If we want to know what good basketball looks like, we do not start our research with non-athletes. Instead, we turn to Michael Jordan, Kobe Bryant, and other “greats” in the sport. Similarly, when people think of melancholy, they do not normally think of passing sadness but of depression (or at least a depressive state). But important issues punctuate a consideration of depression.

Foundational Problems

Every study of the human soul, will, emotions, or intellect is fraught with difficulties. For instance, scientists recognize “that the human brain has close to 100 billion neurons. Neurons release brain chemicals, known as neurotransmitters, which generate these electrical signals in neighboring neurons. The electrical signals propagate like a wave to thousands of neurons, which leads to thought formation.”⁴ But this statement merely describes how the existing brain does the process of thinking. It cannot tell the reader what thinking is, or how it occurs at a more foundational level. Mere electrical impulses do not constitute thought; otherwise, lightning would be the most intelligent of beings.

The same difficulties occur in the attempt to define emotions. We have a reasonable grasp of what emotions feel like. We understand that certain phenomena can cause emotions, attend emotions, or result from emotions. We recognize that emotions intersect not only the body, intellect, and will, but also the spirit, so that emotions can generate (and be generated by) good and bad health, thoughts, decisions, and actions. But we still have not defined what emotions *are*. And God chose not to resolve the issue in his Word.⁵ Instead, the Bible focuses on the whole person—how each facet of our being influences other facets so that the child of God must guard his heart

³ It is telling in the biblical examples selected for this sentence that the weakest form of melancholy (sadness) can have sin as its cause while the strongest form of melancholy (depression) may be innocent. Of course, neither is always the case, and Scripture gives abundant evidence of both endogenous and exogenous melancholy with and without sin as its cause.

⁴ Lina Begdache, “Ask a Scientist: Neurons Help Explain How Our Brains Think,” *PressConnects* March 27, 2019, accessed 18 July 2023, <https://www.pressconnects.com/story/news/local/2019/03/18/ask-scientist-how-do-thoughts-work-our-brain/3153303002/>.

⁵ J. Alasdair Groves and Winston T. Smith observe, “The Bible doesn’t offer a technical answer to the question What are emotions?—as if testifying before a panel of psychological researchers. . . . What the Bible can teach us about emotions is there to guide us in our relationship with God and others.” *Untangling Emotions* (Wheaton: Crossway, 2019), 32.

(Prv 4:23), his soul (Prv 22:5), his spirit (Mal 2:15), his body (1 Thes 4:4), and his actions (Ps 119:9; Lk 12:15) because of their respective ability to influence the whole person.

The inability to define emotion generally or a single emotion specifically to the satisfaction of philosophers, scientists, theologians, and counselors invites us to use inductive or phenomenological methods in studying the biblical evidence lest we stray into unwarranted assumptions.

The Problem of Diagnosis

One reason to resist an investigation of melancholy by modern psychiatric methods stems from the inability of psychiatry to produce criteria for diagnosis that are simultaneously reliable and valid. Although the medical community must stick to material, pathogenic causes, “No physical findings are specific to or diagnostic of depression.”⁶ In spite of this defect in methodology, the National Institute of Mental Health (NIMH) declares that in 2020 alone “an estimated 21.0 million adults in the United States had at least one major depressive episode. This number represented 8.4% of all U.S. adults.”⁷ Of this number “an estimated 14.8 million U.S. adults aged 18 or older had at least one major depressive episode with severe impairment,” which often manifests as chronic pain, fatigue, inability to work, listlessness, anxiety, other mental disturbances, or suicidal ideation.⁸ Moreover, numerous studies rank depression among the top five mental disorders—affecting at least 300 million people worldwide at any given time. The problem is so severe that “one in six people (16.6%) will experience depression at some time in their life.”⁹

While the weightiness of the NIMH and the self-proclaimed certainty of the medical community imply an objective standard for diagnosing melancholy, some professionals question the validity of both these statistics and the associated methods of research. Charles D. Hodges, a medical doctor and theologian observes that while diagnoses of depression increased over 300 percent in the ten-year span 1987–1997, this “rapid increase in the rate of depression was better explained by changes in the criteria used to make the diagnosis rather than as increase in the prevalence of the disease.”¹⁰

The same author observes that all attempts to articulate a defined material pathology for melancholy have failed. This is not to say that known diseases are unable to induce severe melancholy. Multiple sclerosis, Parkinson’s, lupus, and many other illnesses can cause melancholy by unknown mechanisms. In addition, certain medications, trauma, and childbirth can provoke severe melancholy—also by unknown processes. However, scientists have proposed and dismissed, in succession, the theories that deficiencies in serotonin, dopamine, or norepinephrine cause

⁶ Charles D. Hodges, *Good Mood Bad Mood: Help and Hope for Depression and Bipolar Disorder* (Wapwallopen, PA: Shepherd Press, 2012), 40.

⁷ “Major Depression,” National Institute of Mental Health, accessed 5 July 2023, <https://www.nimh.nih.gov/health/statistics/major-depression>.

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ “What Is Depression?” reviewed by Felix Torres, American Psychiatric Association, accessed 30 June 2023, www.psychiatry.org/patients-families/depression/what-is-depression. Richard F. Berg and Christine McCartney cleverly label depression as “the common cold of the mind.” *Depression and the Integrated Life: A Christian Understanding of Sadness and Inner Suffering* (New York: Alba House, 1981), 3.

¹⁰ Hodges, 13 footnote 2.

melancholy.¹¹ “Even today we do not know what the correct balance of serotonin, dopamine, or norepinephrine should be in the human brain.”¹²

Even prior to the lack of results from scientific investigations into material causes for melancholy, theologians turned to God’s Word for input; however, the word *depression* never appears in Scripture. Neither do its cognates *depressive*, *depressing*, *depressed* and *antidepressant*, or the associated words *clinical*, *mental illness*, *episode*, *dysphoria*, *bipolar*, *manic*, *mania*, *dysthymia*, *seasonal affective disorder*, or even the milder words *mood*, *emote*, and *emotion*. This absence of modern designations for melancholia in Scripture leads to several possibilities:

1. Melancholy is a modern phenomenon that did not occur in the premodern, biblical era.
2. Melancholy is an illusion; therefore, Scripture need not address it.
3. Melancholy occurred in the past, but Scripture treats it only by encouraging positive counter-emotions.
4. Melancholy occurred in the past, but Scripture treats it only by critiquing its sinful characteristics.
5. Melancholy occurred in the past, but Scripture uses different phrasing to express it.

The trans-temporally recognizable characteristics of melancholy discredit options (1) and (2). Historically, Hippocrates (c. 460–370 BC) described melancholy (μέλας + χολή, literally “black bile”) as resultative from an excess of certain bodily fluids. While his analysis of the cause seems humorous to us (pun intended), his awareness of its symptoms was sound enough. Aretaeus of Cappadocia (2nd c. AD) listed dullness, dejection, and torpor among the key traits that help the physician diagnose melancholy. Caelius Aurelianus, writing in the 5th c. AD concurs, “The signs of approaching melancholy are . . . anguish and distress, dejections, silence, animosity . . . sometimes a desire to live and at other times a longing for death.”¹³ Melancholy cannot be merely a modern phenomenon or an illusion if it persists across millennia and exhibits identifiable traits.

A number of church fathers seem to have adhered to some form of (3) or (4), reasoning that since “the fruit of the Spirit is love, joy, peace, patience, kindness, goodness, faithfulness, gentleness, self-control” (Gal 5:22–23); and since Jesus and Paul seem to have a dim view of “fainting” (ἐγκακέω) in Luke 18:1, 2 Corinthians 4:1, Galatians 9:9, and 2 Thessalonians 3:13, anything that

¹¹ Meier rather oddly asserts as objective fact what the scientific and medical community knows is merely unproven theory: “Four key chemicals—serotonin, norepinephrine, dopamine, and GABA . . . —are responsible for influencing your ability to experience love, joy, peace, patience, gentleness, humility, energy, motivation, memorization, concentration, a positive attitude, self-acceptance, your dreams, and sanity itself” (1). Note that Meier actually links virtue with chemistry. It would seem that to him the fruit of the Spirit (Gal 5:22) is merely the fruit of healthy chemistry.

¹² Hodges, 45. Specifically, scientists have attempted to treat depression via large doses of these respective neurotransmitters and/or the introduction of drugs that inhibit the re-uptake of these neurotransmitters so that they remain more readily available in the brain. All such pathological investigations have hit a dead end. Although the chemical imbalance theory has prevailed for fifty years and has been the subject of numerous studies, inadequate evidence exists to support it.

¹³ Cited in Neil T. and Joanne Anderson, *Overcoming Depression* (Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 2004), 15.

seems antithetic to these traits must be evil.¹⁴ This thinking led a number of theologians from the second century to the present to treat the broad species of melancholy as vices warranting criticism.¹⁵

The instinct to avoid sin reflects spiritual prudence, but the instinct to treat select emotions as entirely vicious might exhibit a category error. *Love* in Scripture is not an emotion (though it often produces analogous emotions). It is a virtue as described in 1 Corinthians 13. Joy is not the emotion of happiness (though it may result in happiness) but a spiritual delight in God and his work. Peace is not an emotion (though it has emotional implications). It is spiritual wholeness and soundness that generates tranquility of spirit in the midst of turmoil. Similarly, patience, kindness, and the other fruit of the Spirit are virtues, not emotions. While virtues/vices and emotions seem to influence each other, they are not identical. Juxtaposing an emotion to a virtue creates a fallacy of false equivalence. It contrasts dissimilar concepts inappropriately. Until and unless theologians demonstrate that melancholic disorders are inherently sinful (and not primarily emotional, pathogenic, or morally neutral), the impulse toward universal opprobrium seems premature. In fact, theologians may be as guilty as psychiatrists of pontificating about a universal cause without adequate evidentiary support. They just propose mutually exclusive, unsubstantiated theories.

This leaves (5), namely, that some form of severe melancholy has occurred throughout human history since the Fall, but Scripture uses different phrasing to express it. This solution is empirically testable and can yield a clear set of biblical data relating to melancholy (as long as those who engage in the discussion can agree upon indicators or parameters for what constitutes melancholy). We need not be able to define exactly what an emotion *is* in order to discuss what a specific emotion looks like. Common human experience intuits that anger is not the same as tranquility, but it also differs from sadness. Anger responds to a violated sense of justice (or a standard of right and wrong), however corrupted that sense of justice might be. Melancholy occurs in response to loss or pain. In order to qualify as an expression of melancholy, a text ought to exhibit (1) loss coupled with (2) a emotional response to that loss. We have already observed that the Bible never uses modern, clinical designations of melancholy; so the emotional response to loss may take the form of emotionally laden, picturesque language.

Scripture is strikingly metaphorical when it addresses melancholic states. Some of the most poignantly brooding Psalms (like Psalm 88) have almost no direct reference to sorrow at all. Instead, they are full of images that reflect a severely depressed state of feeling. Table 1 exhibits the figures of speech that occur in this Psalm.

¹⁴ “Scripture quotations are from the ESV® Bible (The Holy Bible, English Standard Version®), copyright © 2001 by Crossway, a publishing ministry of Good News Publishers. Used by permission. All rights reserved. The ESV text may not be quoted in any publication made available to the public by a Creative Commons license. The ESV may not be translated in whole or in part into any other language.”

¹⁵ John Cassian listed *λύπη* (*lypē*) and *ἀκηδία* (*akēdia*) as distinct but core sins that lead to a number of other sins. The Latin fathers used *tristitia* in place of *λύπη* to describe melancholic tendencies. In both instances, they left little room for depression as anything other than a sin.

Table 1—Figures of Speech in Psalm 88¹⁶

Metonymy	My life draws near to Sheol
Metonymy	Those who go down to the pit
Simile	Like one set loose among the dead
Simile	Like the slain that lie in the grave
Simile	Like those whom you remember no more
Metonymy	In the depths of the pit, in the regions dark and deep
Metaphor	You overwhelm me with all your waves
Metonymy	My eye grows dim
Metaphor	Dead, departed, grave, Abaddon, darkness, land of forgetfulness
Metaphor	Wrath has swept over me
Metaphor	Dreadful assaults destroy me
Simile	Surround me like a flood
Metaphor	Close in on me together
Metonymy	Companions have become darkness

In its use of metaphor and other figures of speech, the divinely breathed record of human sorrow in the Psalms aligns more closely with the poets, who describe their depression as “the ‘crowding gloom,’ the ‘gathering murk,’ the ‘poisonous mood,’ the ‘howling tempest in the brain,’ ‘the interior doom,’” than with the clinicians and scientists.¹⁷ Yet it is precisely the poetry of the divine record that provides hope for those who suffer today. Scientifically precise labels are unnecessary. In fact, they can be obtrusive in discerning the emotional states reflected in Scripture. Job, the Psalms, Jeremiah, Lamentations, and even the life of the Lord Jesus provide adequate input for us to see our own intensity of melancholy reflected, to parse its causes and effects, and to live life in a fallen world in which we find ourselves emotionally broken but not cast out.

A Problem of Definition

It is difficult to assemble biblical evidence regarding the specific form of severe melancholy that modern psychiatrists call depression. As previously conceded, Scripture does not use modern clinical phrasing; so how can the reader identify the biblical texts that address or depict what we now call depression? The reader could surmount this obstacle by yielding to the conclusions of secular psychology, but this approach is unnecessary. Words usually reflect shared human experience. This commonality makes the essential characteristics of words and even feelings self-evident. There is still significant room for debate regarding the causes, effects, and essential nature of an emotion even when we agree on its basic characteristics. In working from the most extreme melancholic state of depression to simple sadness, we will use the DSM-4 characteristics of a major depressive disorder as

¹⁶ Eswine observes, “[Andrew] Solomon then highlights the commonly used metaphors for depression of going over the edge of a cliff or falling into an abyss. William Styron likewise leaned upon the images of drowning and suffocation to attempt description of his affliction” (68), and “Historian Stanley W. Jackson wrote about this necessary use of metaphor in his *Melancholia & Depression: From Hippocratic Times to Modern Times*. Jackson found ‘no literal statement’, no one-word diagnosis, that was able to describe adequately the diversity of our sadnesses along with their varying fits of gloom and mood. What he found instead were two recurring word-pictures: ‘being in a state of darkness and being weighed down’” (69).

¹⁷ Ibid., 71–72.

a starting point—though we will qualify the inclusions and conclusions derived from that diagnostic list.¹⁸ These characteristics include:

1. Depressed mood
2. Loss of interest/pleasure
3. Weight loss or gain or loss of interest in eating
4. Insomnia or hypersomnia
5. Psychomotor agitation or retardation
6. Fatigue
7. Feeling worthless or excessive/inappropriate guilt or loneliness
8. Decreased concentration
9. Thoughts of death/suicide

According to the DSM, each involved symptom must last for two or more weeks, must occur pervasively either every day or nearly every day, and must rise to a level of intensity that transcends normal sadness. In addition, the sufferer must experience five or more of these symptoms in order to be classified as depressed. Although this list purports to be diagnostic, and although the medical community uses the list in precisely this fashion, the DSM-4 admits that “no laboratory findings that are diagnostic of a Major Depressive Episode have been identified.”¹⁹ Hodges adds, “The problem with these criteria as a diagnostic tool is that they include feelings and experiences that almost everyone has in the course of normal life. Far too many normal things are said to be indicators of a disease according to these criteria.”²⁰ In fact, using these “diagnostic” criteria, some case studies found an 80 percent incidence rate of major depression among the general population.²¹ Finally, imposing a two-week duration of symptoms as a metric presupposes that all sorrows warrant short periods of grieving, or that mere passage of time constitutes a radical upgrade in the level of sadness involved. These assumptions are neither scientific nor sensible. Profound loss can and ought to induce stronger and longer grief. One might grieve the loss of a job and the loss of a child for significantly different periods of time and with significantly different intensities without the latter’s automatically becoming a different category of grief altogether. Given the serious limitations of the DSM diagnostic criteria, it is better to grant that while these criteria work as a starting point for recognizing general melancholy, they cannot discriminate between sadness and depression.

Characterizing Melancholy

This conclusion encourages us to focus on the qualities of sadness in Scripture. The DSM traits do *characterize* melancholy, but they lack diagnostic capability. So if we search the Scriptures for the characteristics of sadness (in both exact words and metaphorical expression), we gain an

¹⁸ M. B. First, ed. *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorder*, 4th ed. (Washington, D.C.: American Psychiatric Association, 1994).

¹⁹ Cited in Hodges, 24 footnote 1.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, 28.

²¹ From his medical experience, Hodges illustrates the problem with the DSM criteria. “What would happen if the diagnostic standard for pneumonia included everyone who coughs?” (28).

appreciation for what God says about melancholy. All of the DSM traits appear in Scripture, and they tend to appear in close and frequent conjunction with each other. Table 2 cross references the nine DSM criteria with the passages of Scripture most indicative of melancholy.

Table 2—Intersection of DSM Characteristics of Depression and Key Biblical Texts

	Sadness, grief, misery, sorrow	Loss of interest or pleasure	Changes in appetite	Trouble sleeping, no rest	Loss of energy, increased fatigue	Purposeless activity	Feeling worthless, guilty, rejected, lonely	Difficulty thinking, concentrating	Death ideation, wish, or obsession	Sustained over time, endless, interminable
1 Samuel 1 (Hannah)	v. 6–8, 10,15ff.	v. 7	v. 7							v. 7
1 Samuel 2 (Hannah)	v. 1		v. 5				v. 1,7			
1 Kings 19 (Elijah)	v. 4				v. 5–7	v. 4	v. 10		v. 4	
Job 3	v. 20–24	v. 6–7	v. 24	v. 13, 17, 26	v. 13		v. 23	v. 3–12	v. 3–19, 21–22	v. 26
Job 6	v. 2		v. 5–7		v. 11–12		v. 4,27	v. 3,10, 26	v. 9	v. 11
Job 7	v. 1,11	v. 7		v. 4, 13–14		v. 3	v. 16, 19	v. 7,9, 16	v. 15–16	v. 2–3
Job 10	v. 1					v. 8	v. 15–17	v. 2ff., 20	v. 1, 18–22	v. 16–17
Job 16	v. 1,16, 20		v. 8		v. 2,15		v. 2,7, 9–14	v. 11–14	v. 22	v. 14
Job 17	v. 1,7	v. 7		v. 12	v. 7	v. 11	v. 2,6	v. 12	v. 1,11, 13–16	v. 15
Job 19	v. 2					v. 8	v. 2, 11–19	v. 7		v. 8,10
Job 30	v. 16, 31			v. 27			v. 20		v. 23	v. 26
<i>Job 31 (Elihu)</i>	v. 19	v. 20	v. 20						v. 21	
Psalms 6 (David)	v. 2,6			v. 6	v. 7		v. 1,4		v. 5	v. 3
Psalms 13 (David)	v. 2						v. 1	v. 2	v. 3	v. 1,2
Psalms 38 (David)	v. 6	v. 10			v. 10	v. 13, 14	v. 1	v. 8		v. 15
Psalms 69 (David)	v. 3,10			v. 3	v. 3		v. 4,11, 20		v. 2,15	
Psalms 77 (Asaph)	v. 3	v. 2		v. 6		v. 4		v. 3, 6		v. 7
Psalms 88 (Heman)	v. 3,9				v. 4	v. 10–12	v. 5–7		v. 3–6	v. 1,17

	Sadness, grief, misery, sorrow	Loss of interest or pleasure	Changes in appetite	Trouble sleeping, no rest	Loss of energy, increased fatigue	Purposeless activity	Feeling worthless, guilty, rejected, lonely	Difficulty thinking, concentrating	Death ideation, wish, or obsession	Sustained over time, endless, interminable
Psalm 102 (Unknown)	v. 5,9	v. 4	v. 4	v. 8	v. 23	v. 11	v. 6,10		v. 3,11, 23	v. 3
Lam 3 (Jeremiah)	v. 1,15, 49,51	v. 17	v. 16	v. 17	v. 20	v. 9	v. 10ff.	v. 17	v. 6	v. 3,7
<i>Lam 1</i> (<i>Judah</i>)	v. 2,4, 12,16	v. 16	v. 20	v. 3	v. 6,13, 14	v. 17	v. 2,19		v. 20	v. 13
Jonah	2:1,7, 4:1	4:5			2:7, 4:8		2:4	4:4, 4:9–11	2:5–6, 4:3,8	4:5
Isaiah 53 (Jesus)	v. 3,4, 10–11						v. 3,4		v. 12	
Mt 26–27	26:37						27:46		26:38	
Mk 14–15	14:33						15:34		14:34	
Luke 22	v. 44				v. 43					

By DSM reckoning, a psychologist would likely conclude that Hannah, Elijah, Job, David, Asaph, Heman, the unknown author of Psalm 102, Jeremiah, Jonah, Jesus and possibly others in Scripture were clinically depressed (experiencing a “Major Depressive Episode”). But Hodges observes, “The tools given to us by the creators of the DSM—the nine criteria . . . —are unable to distinguish between normal and disordered sadness.”²² So this dubious diagnosis that groups all “depression” into an undifferentiated lump is not as helpful as simply recognizing the incredible depth and breadth of human sadness that appears in Scripture. If a diagnosis is medical without a known pathogenic cause, the sufferer is left without recourse except to dull the pain by narcotics. But if the *full* spectrum of sadness reflects normal human experience that relates to the intensity and duration of loss in a fallen world, there is hope. Table 3 charts such depth of sorrow.

Table 3—Key Biblical Descriptions of Profound Sorrow

Text	Key Descriptions
1 Samuel 1	provoke grievously, irritate, wept, would not eat, weep, sad, deeply distressed, wept bitterly, affliction, troubled in spirit, pouring out my soul, anxiety, vexation
1 Kings 19	Afraid, take away my life, no better, I only am left
Job 3	perish, darkness, nor light shine, gloom, deep darkness, clouds, blackness, terrify, not rejoice, barren, no joyful cry, curse, trouble, die, expire, misery, bitter in soul, long for death, grave, sighing, no bread, groanings, fear, dread, not at ease, no rest

²² Hodges, 64. See also the fuller description of this problem on pp. 66–68.

Job 6	vexation, calamity, heavier, rash, poison, terrors, tasteless, crush, cut off, exult in pain, no strength, driven from me, despairing, wind
Job 7	hard service, shadow, emptiness, misery, night is long, tossing, worms and dirt, hardens, breaks out, without hope, breath, never again see good, gone, fades, vanishes, Sheol, returns no more, anguish, bitterness, scare, terrify, choose strangling, death, loathe life, leave me alone, made me your mark, burden, lie in earth
Job 10	loathe life, complaint, bitterness, why contend, oppress, despise, destroyed me, clay, return to dust, disgrace, hunt like a lion, work wonders against me, vexation toward me, died, grave, darkness, deep shadow, gloom
Job 16	pain, worn out, desolate, shriveled up, witness against me, leanness, torn, hated, gnashed at, struck, broken, seized, dashed, set up as a target, slashes open, pours out gall, breach upon breach, sackcloth, strength in the dust, red with weeping, deep darkness, scorn, tears, no return
Job 17	spirit is broken, days are extinct, graveyard, mockers, byword, men spit, eye dim, vexation, shadow, appalled, days are past, plans broken off, night, darkness, Sheol, pit, worm, descend, dust
Job 19	violence, no justice, walled up, darkness, stripped, broken down, hope pulled up, wrath, adversary, put far, estranged, stranger, foreigner, breath is strange, stench, despise, abhor, turned against, bones stick, destroyed, heart faints
Job 30	byword, humbled, calamity, terrors, passed away, poured out, affliction, night, racks my bones, pain, no rest, disfigured, mire, dust, ashes, cry, no answer, cruel, toss about, death, ruins, disaster, evil came, darkness, turmoil, never still, affliction, skin turns black, bones burn, mourning, weep
Job 31	Pain, continual strife in bones, loathes bread, flesh wasted away, bones stick out, soul draws near the pit, death
Psalms 6	languishing, bones troubled, soul troubled, how long, no remembrance, Sheol, weary, moaning, flood my bed with tears, weeping, eye wastes away, grief, weak
Psalms 13	how long, forget, hide your face, counsel in my soul, sorrow all the day, sleep of death, shaken
Psalms 38	no soundness, no health, heavy burden, too heavy, stink and fester, bowed down, prostrate, all the day, mourning, burning, feeble, crushed, groan, tumult of heart, sighing, throbs, strength fails, light of my eyes has gone, stand aloof, deaf, mute, ready to fall, pain is ever before me
Psalms 69	waters to my neck, sink in deep mire, no foothold, deep waters, flood sweeps over me, weary with crying, throat is parched, eyes grow dim, hate me without cause, destroy me, attack me with lies, reproach, stranger, alien, humbled, fasting, sackcloth, byword, pit, distress, shame, dishonor, despair, no pity, no comforter, poison for food, sour wine, afflicted, in pain,
Psalms 77	cry, trouble, refuses to be comforted, moan, spirit faints, hold my eyelids open, cannot speak, spurn, never favorable, love forever ceased, promises at an end, forgotten, shut up compassion,
Psalms 88	cry, troubles, Sheol, pit, no strength, dead, slain, grave, remembered no more, cut off, depths, dark and deep, heavy, overwhelm, shun, horror, shut in, cannot escape, dim, sorrow, Abaddon, darkness, forgetfulness, cast away, hide your face, afflicted, terrors, helpless, swept over, dreadful assaults, destroy me, surround me, flood
Psalms 102	cry, distress, pass away, smoke, bones burn, heart is struck down, like grass, forget to eat bread, loud groaning, bones cling, like a desert owl, lie awake, like a lonely sparrow, eat ashes, mingle tears with my drink, thrown me down, like an evening shadow, wither away, destitute, groans, prisoners, doomed to die, broken my strength, shortened my days
Lam 3	affliction, driven, darkness, no light, the whole day long, flesh wastes away, broken bones, besieged, enveloped, bitterness, tribulation, like the dead, walled about, cannot escape, heavy, cry, blocked, crooked, torn to pieces, bent his bow, target for his arrow, laughingstock, taunts, wormwood, gravel, ashes, bereft of peace, forgotten happiness endurance perished, gall, bowed down, silence, dust, grief, eyes flow without ceasing, hunted, pit, lost
Isaiah 53	no form or majesty, no beauty, despised, rejected, man of sorrows, acquainted with grief, hide their faces, stricken, smitten by God, afflicted, pierced, crushed, chastisement, wounds, oppressed, opened not his mouth, stricken, grave, death, anguish, poured out soul to death

Jonah	distress, belly of Sheol, deep, heart of the seas, flood, waves, billows, driven from your sight, waters closed in, deep surrounded, went down, bars closed upon me forever, pit, fainting away, displeased, take my life (x2), faint, asked to die
Mt, Mk, Lk ²³	sorrowful, troubled, very sorrowful, even to death, forsaken, greatly distressed, agony, sweat like drops of blood

An initial observation on this biblical data seems appropriate. Except in the case of Jonah, these expressions of sorrow—even to the point of severe despondency and depression—receive no condemnation. They are not declared to be wrong (nor are they declared to be right). Scripture treats them matter-of-factly as part of normal human experience. The Holy Spirit moves the writers of Scripture seamlessly between praise (Psalm 103) and lament (Psalm 102) without apology or rebuke for the sorrows that men feel. And in many Psalms this shift is even more immediate because it is internal to the Psalm. The praise of Psalm 89:1–37 gives place to the sorrows and agitation of Psalm 89:38–51 before swinging back again to praise in v. 52. Ron Horton observes, “Our spirits do not always soar, as we well know. In fact, they may sink more often than they soar. It is time then to make the same claim for low spirits made for high—that they are no less warranted by Scripture and can work for good.”²⁴ Where God has not clearly condemned an action, thought, or feeling (especially sorrow, which he covers in such intimate detail and frequency), we would do well to tread lightly and hesitantly in pronouncing our own condemnation, lest we find ourselves numbered among Job’s “friends,” who, somewhat ironically, receive severe rebuke from God (Job 42:7–8).

Since the Scriptures address melancholy in significant detail, the biblical theologian has numerous avenues of research:

- Do *other* passages outside of the classic severe cases in Job, the Psalms, and Jeremiah indicate that sadness is always, often, seldom, or never sin?
- Do additional texts unfold the workings of sadness?
- How does God personally interact with those who are sad? Is the corrective for sadness one of rebuke, warning, encouragement, restatement of theological fact, or something else?
- What are the immediate causes of melancholy?
- What consequences stem from melancholy? Even if the emotion is not sin in itself, does it *cause* sin?
- Do the Scriptures encourage us to avoid sadness?
- What does it mean that Jesus is a man of sorrows and acquainted with grief? How close did he come to what clinicians today would call “depression”?

²³ In Matthew 16:14, the disciples respond variously to Jesus’ question, “Who do people say that the Son of Man is?” Some said, “John the Baptist.” That is not difficult to understand. The Jews knew that John and Jesus preached the same message (“repent for the kingdom of heaven is at hand”; Mt 3:2, 4:17) in some of the same places (the Judean wilderness, alongside Jordan, outlying districts). Others said, “Elijah.” That is also easy to see. Both Elijah and Jesus performed miracles and spoke with a boldness that marked them as men of God. But the most puzzling assessment is this: “Jeremiah.” Jesus’ message, location, origin, background, and manner were radically different from Jeremiah’s; so what did people see to connect them? Possibly their *mood*. Jeremiah was a weeping prophet, apparently melancholic at times, and Jesus was a man of sorrows, acquainted with griefs. While it is impossible to prove conclusively, it is conceivable that the connection the Jews saw between Jeremiah and Jesus centered on their emotional disposition.

²⁴ Ronald Horton, *Mood Tides: Divine Purpose in the Rhythms of Life* (Greenville, SC: JourneyForth, 2008), 141.

Our concern lies elsewhere. In both its endogenous and exogenous forms, melancholy seems to reflect a theological truth: the Fall has fatally marred this world and everything in it, especially those creatures made in the image of God. The Fall damaged the entirety of our being—body, will, intellect, spirit, and emotions.²⁵ Melancholy is the emotion distinctly situated to express the Fall.

Key Theological Concepts

Two theological concepts guide a study of melancholy and the Fall. First, because God created humans as his image bearers, God's own emotions have direct bearing on what people should experience in response to their circumstances. Second, The Fall marred everything that adjoins humanity. A study of the effects of the Fall—both its stated and implied consequences—will guide the expectation of what constitutes legitimate and illegitimate responses to the Fall.

Sadness in the Divine

Several passages indicate that God can experience sadness. This does not entail that he undergoes change, for his impassibility means that his sorrow must stem ultimately from his own essential being rather its being “inflicted” on him externally.²⁶ Ephesians 4:30 warns, “And do not grieve the Holy Spirit of God.” *Grief* is the ordinary word *λυπεῖτε* in the imperative, directed at people, and in regard to what *they* do in reference to the Holy Spirit (since the Spirit is the direct object of the verb). Whatever impassibility *does* mean, it *cannot* mean that external personal actions of God's people have no bearing on the instantiation of the existing, essential emotional state of the Spirit. Perhaps emotions do not represent *change* at all but an effulgence or instantiation of our inner person with all of its loves, hates, and values. In this case, grief in this passage is not a change in the divine person but the intersection of what God loves and values with the corrupted values and actions of his people. God does not move or change, but our conduct may strike at what he loves and values so that it instantiates an emotion already inhering in his person and exhibits the proper feeling in relation to that injured love or injured value. In this case, it is grief.

We need not settle this theological discussion regarding divine passibility or impassibility or arrive at a full comprehension of its meaning in order to recognize that Scripture attributes grief to the Spirit. This grief is based on a real “loss” that is incurred through the failure of God's image bearers to respond in a fashion that reflects his glory as they ought. This loss seems to correspond to what is expressed in Romans 3:23, “For all have sinned and *fall short* of the glory of God.” Humanity had (and has) a responsibility to reflect God's person accurately and truly as his image bearers, and when we fail to do so through sin, God is deprived of his due—a mystery to be sure, but a clear biblical statement nonetheless.

²⁵ One might add or subtract specific components here depending on whether he holds a more synthetic or analytical view of humanity, but orthodox theology addresses the impacts of the fall on the entirety of the human person.

²⁶ As representative of the arguments defending impassibility, see Norman L. Geisler, *Systematic Theology in One Volume* (Minneapolis: Bethany House, 2011), 462–70. But note that like many other systematic theologians, Geisler spends almost no time on the emotions that God does experience (five lines on p. 469). He is more concerned with defending the systematic theological conclusions regarding divine impassibility than with specific biblical evidence for divine emotions.

Jesus, too, experienced sadness—even profound sadness—but writers often feel the need to qualify this fact.²⁷ When we observe that “he was deeply moved in his spirit and greatly troubled” (Jn 11:33) at the grief of others, that he himself “wept” (Jn 11:35) at loss, that “he began to be sorrowful and troubled” (Mt 26:37) when approaching the cross, or that he could be “grieved at their hardness of heart,” (Mk 3:5), we have evidence of sadness that corresponds to loss.

Finally, God the Father feels sorrow. Hodges notes, “Remarkably, the first use of any word pertaining to sad, sadness, or sorrow appears in Genesis 6:6. There God said that he was ‘sorry’ that he had created man,” and it “grieved him to his heart.”²⁸ While Hodges overlooks the connection between “pain” (Gn 3:16, 17) and “grief” (Gn. 6:6)—and so overstates the claim that Genesis 6:6 is the first reference to sorrow—his overall point still has value. After God explicitly announces the effects of the Fall, the “pain/grief” that the Fall caused was shared by God as a form of personal loss when his creatures strayed even further from him into darkness. Adam felt the Fall in specified forms of loss, but God felt certain effects of the Fall as well (Gn 6:6).

Given that God made humans in his own image (Gn 1:26–27), that God has emotions, and that the emotion of sadness correlates to the losses brought by the Fall, it seems reasonable to conclude that human sadness is, likewise, a reflection of the Fall. Since God’s responses to the Fall are untainted by sin, it is, perhaps, too audacious for Christian theologians and counselors to assume that *every* expression of profound grief is inherently sinful. The fact that all humans are marred does not necessitate that every action, thought, and feeling of a marred being—especially one who is redeemed by Christ—is sin.²⁹

The Nature of the Fall

Although Arminian and Calvinist theologians differ in regard to the nature of the imputation of Adam’s guilt, orthodox Protestants recognize and confess that every human is fatally flawed spiritually, having inherited a sinful nature from Adam, and is unable to do good on his own. This does not mean that humans are as evil as possible. We could always more sin more grievously, more

²⁷ E.g., Geisler writes that Jesus’ divine nature did not suffer. Only his human nature did (468). While this position safeguards impassibility, it may be begging the question since it presupposes that there can be no sorrow at all in the divine nature. But this presence or absence of emotion in the divine is precisely the point to be tested. The divine nature could not suffer *physically* since the divine nature is not physical, but if Scripture implies that the divine nature can experience the emotion of grief or sadness, perhaps our philosophical theology should give place to what God revealed about himself. Note as well that Geisler and others who defend strong impassibility tend to resolve the tension through an appeal to anthropomorphisms (the Bible describes God in human terms in order to communicate effectively). But Scripture provides more warrant for viewing humanity deo-morphically than it does for viewing God anthropomorphically. See Judson D. Greene, “At the Left Hand of the Son: God the Father’s Spatial Manifestation in Heaven” (unpublished MA thesis: BJU Seminary, 2020), for the biblical evidence that depicts a visible, localized manifestation of the Father’s person or presence in a fashion that implies Scripture may view humanity at least as deo-morphically as it speaks of God anthropomorphically.

²⁸ Hodges, 75. Is it accidental that the word used near the end of the verse to describe God’s feeling (עצב) appears in Genesis 3:16 and 3:17 (here a cognate, עֲצִיבֹן) to describe the “pain” that both the woman and the man would experience as a result of the Fall?

²⁹ Again, the debate is not whether the Bible presents the reality that there is no conduct of the wicked that is, in fact, righteous. Rather, are the sorrows of the redeemed inherently sinful?

intentionally, and more extensively than we do at present. But we are marred in body, intellect, will, and spirit so that we are incapable of having a right standing with God through our own merit.³⁰

The Fall damaged humanity spiritually, socially, and physically. Its most notable effects include separation from God, loss of fellowship with him, loss of innocence, conflict (especially in fractured marital relationships), pain in childbearing, pain in daily work and survival, loss of peace and wholeness, expulsion from the garden, and physical death. Very soon, other losses would pile up as it became evident that humanity would now experience every form of sin and misery—the loss of humility, altruism, joy, love, peace, and truth. Every effect of the Fall displays both *pain* and *loss*. The pain that resulted from the Fall is explicit (Gn 3:16–17). The loss is often implicit. Every loss inflicts pain. Every pain is a loss. Loss and sadness connect so intimately that we describe those who do not experience sadness as a result of loss as *pathological*. Hodges observes, “If sadness is connected to loss, the history of normal sadness starts in the garden of Eden, the scene of humanity’s greatest loss.”³¹ How is it that the world treats those who do exhibit profound sadness in the face of loss as mentally disordered (depressed) while it treats those who do not exhibit sadness in the face of loss as even more mentally disordered (pathological)? Something ought to give. And a sound theology of melancholy might orient believers to view the world as God does—handling sorrow in a more thoroughly biblical way regardless of how deep that sorrow may become.

Those who experience melancholy find that some within the Christian community perpetrate a bitter irony and injustice through intellectual preferentialism and bias. If a theologian has a precise and orthodox *intellectual* understanding of the Fall and its consequences so that he can define accurately the extent and nature of depravity, its effects on the earth, the deadness of the human spirit, and the necessity of external redemption and restoration, the theological community praises him. If that same person experiences profoundly dark *emotions* that are an accurate, direct emotional assessment of and response to the Fall (that is, he “*feels* the Fall”), the same theological community may treat him as spiritually immature or as actively sinning. Somehow, it is appropriate to philosophize about the Fall, but we dare not feel its effects (or at least admit that we do). Such intellectual prejudice treats mental accuracy regarding the Fall as more true, real, and godly than emotional accuracy regarding that same Fall. Does melancholy not depict accurately the depth to which humanity has sunk? Far from being an unbridled and extreme reaction to “slight” and “temporary” reversals, melancholy—especially in its strong forms that approach depression—more accurately reflects the true depth and darkness of the current human condition than any optimist could. At the Fall, we lost everything worth having. That loss is worth grieving.

³⁰ Any number of conservative theologians present the essential concept of total depravity effectively. See Wayne Grudem, *Systematic Theology* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1994), 494–504; Rolland McCune, *A Systematic Theology of Biblical Christianity*, vol. 2 (Detroit: Detroit Baptist Theological Seminary, 2009), 62–70.

³¹ “You can begin to sense the crushing emotional weight Adam and Eve must have felt, standing outside the garden and knowing they would never get back inside. . . . They could see all the good things they had lost. Fear of God replaced the fellowship they had enjoyed. Pain would be a part of childbirth. Toil would be added to labor because the ground would grow thorns and thistles as quickly as grain. An angel with a flaming sword stood at the garden gate to prevent their return. An uncertain world awaited them into which the ultimate Enemy had been introduced” (Hodges, 75).

The Mirror of Melancholy

The entire world has experienced damage through the Fall, but it does not entail that people experience the depths of the Fall equally. The full spectrum of melancholy as exhibited in Table 4 mirrors the same stages of decay, degeneration, pain, and sorrow that exist around and in us.

Table 4—A Spectrum of Melancholy

Normalcy	Sadness	Despondency	Depression
Does not recognize loss	Normal response to loss Significant response to loss Grief, sorrow	Profound response to loss Dysthymia Enduring sense of pain	Profound response to loss “Major depression” Long enduring sense of pain
Happiness Wholeness Views the world neutrally or optimistically	Temporary or iterative sense of pain Occasional traits of depression Self-esteem remains intact Death thought about only in terms of eventually joining a loved one	Some traits of depression Significant irritability Death wish as inflicted by external agent or obsession with death	Loss of interest or pleasure in activities and eating Trouble sleeping/oversleeping Fatigue; torpor Purposelessness; abulia (lack of will) Feeling worthless Difficulty concentrating or thinking Death wish as inflicted by self
Emotional “health”	Emotional “sickness”	Emotional “hospitalization”	Emotional “flatlining”

A few crucial caveats are in order. First, Table 4 does not include despair since despair (in most cases excepting actual disease or trauma as its immediate cause) involves a hopelessness and faithlessness that has moved beyond a mere emotional state into a moral one. Despair (usually) involves sin. Second, the bottom row does not imply that melancholia relates *in fact* to disease. The materialist view of the human person (a purely pathogenic assessment of melancholy) finds warrant in neither Scripture nor medical science. However, there are enough analogies between what happens in the physical and the emotional realms to warrant their juxtaposition. Moreover, the biblical authors use phrasing that refers to sadness metaphorically in terms of sickness and depression metaphorically in terms of death. Therefore, while we must guard against a “disease mentality” toward melancholic states, we are on sure footing when we retain biblical imagery that conveys respective states of emotional health, sickness, and death. Finally, there is no strong allegiance to the number of divisions in the table. Whether an analyst believes there are two, three, five, or more categories, the sense of progression from health through sickness to death appears throughout the created order.

The earth itself desperately needs divine hospitalization (Rom 8:19–23) and final resurrection (2 Pt 3:10, 12–13) to reverse the thousands of years of accumulated ruin since the Fall. Apart from divine intervention, everything in the created order is headed toward death in every possible way (heat death, resource death, human death, animal death, emotional death, spiritual death). Because (1) the biblical descriptions of severe melancholic conditions heavily utilize phrasing that pertains to death, (2) because medical diagnostics (as unproductive as they may sometimes be) recognizes a strong death wish among those suffering from extreme forms of melancholy, and (3) because the personal reflections of those who have passed through profound, prolonged levels of sorrow involves a palpable darkness, heaviness, and torpor that reflects death, severe melancholy appears to be the

emotional equivalent of flatlining. One reason that depressed people find no pleasure in any activity, have no desire to eat, spend so much time sleeping, and experience profound fatigue is that they are experiencing a sort of emotional death. While this assessment might, itself, seem hopeless, the biblical record points us to a God who raises the dead. Whether this takes the form of drawing out one who is sinking in quicksand (Ps 69:14), throwing a life preserver to the drowning (Ps 69:15), or reviving a dead heart (Ps 69:32), God can bring the dead to life.³²

What Melancholy Shows

There is no simpler way to demonstrate that melancholy mirrors the pain and loss of the Fall than to look at the wealth of biblical evidence. Here, we experience an embarrassment of riches. Even leaving out the metaphoric descriptions of loss, ordinary words for grief occur hundreds of times in Scripture (some of the more common include λυπέω 90, λύπη 65, κλαίω 206, κλαυθμός 49, ὀδύνη 76, ὀδυνάω 15, στενάζω 33, πένθος 57, ὀλολύζω 22, θρηνέω 34; and these leave out words relating to pain and loss specifically, which would add many more). Methodologically, we must examine how the Fall and grief interrelate if we are to test the thesis that the melancholic emotions are a mirror of that Fall.

Every instance of grief, sorrow, discouragement, and depression in Scripture stems from and reflects the Fall. The Fall damaged the physical and social order so that every operation in this world has succumbed not only to the vanity of Ecclesiastes but also to pain and loss. The scientist who studies chemistry may rejoice in its structure while remaining unaware that the beauty and order in chemistry are broken. He observes a disordered order. Prior to the Fall, the chemistry of the human body functioned perfectly and harmoniously so that there was no pain, sorrow, and death. So when people experience genuine chemical problems that produce profound sorrow, that emotion accurately reflects a real loss experienced in the Fall. When a young person is isolated by her peers and she spirals into teen depression, her grief reflects the loss of companionship and the fracturing of relationships incurred in the Fall. Simply telling her to “cheer up” or admonishing that discouragement is sin does not always resolve the problem, because fundamentally the melancholic person knows (and has correctly assessed and felt) intuitively the loss brought about by the Fall. When the philosopher or historian investigates his respective field and finds an endless litany of dead ends, injustice, brutality, and nihilistic futility, and these precipitate his descent into emotional darkness, that darkness accurately reflects the trauma of the Fall. Glossing over the barbaric inhumanity of every generation, the mass slaughter, the totalitarian egoism of political rulers in every age, and the raw pointlessness of it all does not help. The world *is* as damaged as the historian

³² See my “The Prayer of Faith Will Save the Sick”: Revisiting a Complex Passage in Light of Biblical Context—James 5:13–18,” *Journal of Biblical Theology and Worldview* 1/1 (Fall 2020): 44–68 available at <https://seminary.bju.edu/seminary-journal/volume-1-number-1-fall-2020/>. The intersection of that article with the present one may explain why depression requires intervention from spiritual leaders. If sufferers have emotionally “flatlined,” they may no longer be able to pray effectively for themselves. Perhaps God has designed his people to be the emotional equivalent of a defibrillator.

observes. Humanity *is* cruel. Life *is* nasty, brutish, and short.³³ Table 5 plots the major effects of the Fall, which are themselves representative causes of grief.

Table 5—The Fall, Via Pain and Loss, As the Source of All Forms of Melancholy

The Fall	Representative Causes	Melancholia	Sinful Responses
	Physical Causes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chemical (e.g., postpartum) • Genetic (e.g., hyperthyroidism) • Microbial (e.g., Covid-19) • Injury (e.g., head trauma) • Atmospheric (e.g., air pressure) • Suffering (e.g., ME, CFS, toil) 		Pride
	Emotional Causes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Normal sorrow intensified • Unresolved anger • Loneliness • Disaffection • Injustice (experienced) 		<i>Acedia</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ennui • Inertness • Torpor • Inactivity
	Intellectual Causes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Philosophy (e.g., nihilism) • History (e.g., war/politics) • Projection (e.g., climate issues) 		<i>Tristitia</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Despair • Hopelessness • Suicide
	Spiritual Causes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guilt • Underlying vice (e.g., anxiety) • Unanswered prayer • Unfairness of life 		<i>Ira</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Wrath • Anger • Impatience • Frustration

Melancholia speaks truth about the Fall.³⁴ Cain ought to have been grieved when God disapproved of his sacrifice (Gn 4:5). He really did experience the loss of divine favor, but he ought to have handled his grief differently. Lamech was right to feel sorrow over the “painful toil” of the curse (Gn 5:29), he understood the loss of harmony and peace that the Fall incurred. Hannah properly grasped another kind of loss—a loss that reveals a strikingly godlike quality all humans possess in their ability to grieve not only what is, but what could be (1 Sm 1:5–11). We grieve loss in the past (regret, guilt, remembered sorrows). We mourn loss in the present (active sorrows). And we look into the future and grieve losses that are yet to come. Hannah had not lost a child. She did not have a child to begin with. Her sorrow reflected loss, but it was a loss of what ought to have been, not a loss of what already had been.³⁵ We experience loss when violence occurs to us or to someone

³³ Is it an accident that the philosopher Thomas Hobbes generated this expression in his *Leviathan*?

³⁴ “For the Christian, these emotions are literally a right and reasonable reaction to a fuller knowledge of the creation of which they are a part.” George A. Benson, *What To Do When You’re Depressed: A Christian Psychoanalyst Helps You Understand and Overcome Your Depression* (Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1975), 11.

³⁵ Hannah was not alone in carrying this burden of an unrealized desire. Genesis 30:1–2 depicts Rachel’s similar frustration over the lack of children, but it provides no evidence of her seeking the Lord in the midst of her sorrow until Genesis 30:22–24.

we love (Gn 34:7), loss over our own sin (Gn. 45:5), loss over the apathy of others (2 Kgs 13:19, which is also another example of an anticipated loss of a future blessing), loss of health (Ps 41:3), loss from threats made by others (Ps 55:2), loss from foolish children (Prv 17:21, 25), loss from discomfort (Jon 4:9), losses due to natural disasters and war (Is 19:10), and losses in death (2 Sm 19:3).³⁶

Nothing in Scripture specifies what God considers an acceptable duration for our grief. The sensitive soul may carry grief longer and bear its scars far more deeply than someone of even temperament, but every one of these griefs reflects the Fall.³⁷ In fact, like no other emotion we possess, sadness is a mirror of the Fall. Wherever there are tears, there is evidence of the Fall. Wherever you see sorrow—whether it is mild or morose—the Fall is written raw in emotion. Table 6 serves as both a foundation and a capstone to our theme by depicting expressions of sorrow throughout Scripture as directly correlated to the losses experienced by the Fall.

Table 6—Select Texts Correlating Sorrow to the Fall

Passage	Text	Effects of the Fall that Cause Sorrow	
		Pain	Loss
Gn 3:16	To the woman he said, “I will surely multiply your pain in childbearing; in pain you shall bring forth children. Your desire shall be contrary to your husband, but he shall rule over you.”	childbearing, fractured relationships	wellness, harmony
Gn 3:17–19	And to Adam he said, “Because you have listened to the voice of your wife and have eaten of the tree of which I commanded you, ‘You shall not eat of it,’ cursed is the ground because of you; in pain you shall eat of it all the days of your life; thorns and thistles it shall bring forth for you; and you shall eat the plants of the field. By the sweat of your face you shall eat bread, till you return to the ground, for out of it you were taken; for you are dust, and to dust you shall return.”	curse, pain (general), toil, death	shalom, ease, productivity, life
Gn 4:5 cf. 4:6	But for Cain and his offering he had no regard. So Cain was very angry , and his face fell.	rejection	divine approval

³⁶ A poignant example of the loss of children to death comes from the private correspondence of Robert Lewis Dabney. A minister, chaplain, and theologian of the mid-1800s, Dabney lost three sons to diphtheria, two of which occurred within a week. His testimony is emotionally compelling: “When my Jimmy died, the grief was painfully sharp, but the actings of faith, the embracing of consolation, and all the cheering truths which ministered comfort to me were just as vivid; but when the stroke was repeated, and thereby doubled, I seem to be paralyzed and stunned. I know that my loss is doubled, and I know also that the same cheering truths apply to the second as to the first, but I remain numb, downcast, almost without hope and interest. When I turned away from Jimmy’s corpse to my lovely infant, my affections and fears seemed to flow out towards him with a strength both sweet and agonizing. I never tired of folding him in my arms, as the sweet substitute for my loss, nor of trembling for him also, lest the loss should extend to him. But when Bobby was taken, and our little one remained our only hope, it seemed to me, I was both afraid and reluctant to center my affections on him. I feel towards him a mixture of weak, listless feelings and pain, not having the heart to be happy in his caresses, and not daring. This is strange, perhaps inexplicable. Death has struck me with a dagger of ice.” Thomas Cary Johnson, *The Life and Letters of Robert Lewis Dabney* (1903; reprint, Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1977).

³⁷ “‘Normal sadness’ is something that happens to most of us when we lose something very important to us. . . . The intensity and duration of our sadness corresponds to the size and duration of the loss” (Hodges, 62).

Gn 5:29	And [Lamech] called his name Noah, saying, “Out of the ground that the LORD has cursed, this one shall bring us relief from our work and from the painful toil of our hands.”	toil	rest
Gn 6:6	And the LORD regretted that he had made man on the earth, and it grieved him to his heart.	wickedness	unspecified
Gn 34:7	The sons of Jacob had come in from the field as soon as they heard of it, and the men were indignant and very angry , because he had done an outrageous thing in Israel by lying with Jacob’s daughter, for such a thing must not be done.	sexual assault, shame	purity, honor
Gn 35:18 cf. 48:7	And as her soul was departing (for she was dying), she called his name Ben-oni ; but his father called him Benjamin.	death	life
Gn 42:38 cf. Gn 44:29 cf. Gn 44:31	But he said, “My son shall not go down with you, for his brother is dead, and he is the only one left. If harm should happen to him on the journey that you are to make, you would bring down my gray hairs with sorrow to Sheol.”	death of child	child’s presence
Gn 45:5	And now do not be distressed or angry with yourselves because you sold me here, for God sent me before you to preserve life.	guilt	innocence
Gn 50:10	When they came to the threshing floor of Atad, which is beyond the Jordan, they lamented there with a very great and grievous lamentation , and he made a mourning for his father seven days.	death, deprivation of father	life, father’s presence
Ex 1:14	and made their lives bitter with hard service, in mortar and brick, and in all kinds of work in the field. In all their work they ruthlessly made them work as slaves.	toil, cruelty	rest, proper service relationships
Ex 3:7	Then the LORD said, “I have surely seen the affliction of my people who are in Egypt and have heard their cry because of their taskmasters. I know their sufferings .”	toil, cruelty	rest, proper service relationships
1 Sm 1:4–10	But to Hannah he gave a double portion, because he loved her, though the LORD had closed her womb. And her rival used to provoke her grievously to irritate her, because the LORD had closed her womb. So it went on year by year. As often as she went up to the house of the LORD, she used to provoke her. Therefore Hannah wept and would not eat. And Elkanah, her husband, said to her, “Hannah, why do you weep? And why do you not eat? And why is your heart sad? Am I not more to you than ten sons?” After they had eaten and drunk in Shiloh, Hannah rose. Now Eli the priest was sitting on the seat beside the doorpost of the temple of the LORD. She was deeply distressed and prayed to the LORD and wept bitterly .	barrenness, provocation, irritation, marital tension	present favor, future child, peace, divine favor, understanding
1 Sm 2:33	The only one of you whom I shall not cut off from my altar shall be spared to weep his eyes out to grieve his heart, and all the descendants of your house shall die by the sword of men.	outcast, misery, death	ministry, prosperity
1 Sm 15:35–16:1	And Samuel did not see Saul again until the day of his death, but Samuel grieved over Saul. And the LORD regretted that he had made Saul king over Israel. The LORD said to Samuel, “How long will you grieve over Saul, since I have rejected him from being king over Israel?”	rejection	office
1 Sm 20:3	But David vowed again, saying, “Your father knows well that I have found favor in your eyes, and he thinks, ‘Do not let Jonathan know this, lest he be grieved .’ But truly, as the LORD lives and as your soul lives, there is but a step between me and death.”	family dishonor, injustice	honor, justice

1 Sm 20:34	And Jonathan rose from the table in fierce anger and ate no food the second day of the month, for he was grieved for David, because his father had disgraced him.	family dishonor, injustice	honor, justice
1 Sm 25:31	“My lord shall have no cause of grief or pangs of conscience for having shed blood without cause or for my lord working salvation himself. And when the LORD has dealt well with my lord, then remember your servant.”	injustice	justice
2 Sm 19:2–3	So the victory that day was turned into mourning for all the people, for the people heard that day, “The king is grieving for his son.” And the people stole into the city that day as people steal in who are ashamed when they flee in battle.	death, dishonor, defeat	son’s life, honor, victory
2 Kgs 13:19	Then the man of God was angry with him and said, “You should have struck five or six times; then you would have struck down Syria until you had made an end of it, but now you will strike down Syria only three times.”	apathy, defeat	opportunity, victory
2 Chr 6:29	Whatever prayer, whatever plea is made by any man or by all your people Israel, each knowing his own affliction and his own sorrow and stretching out his hands toward this house.	generalized pain	generalized loss
Est 6:12	Then Mordecai returned to the king's gate. But Haman hurried to his house, mourning and with his head covered.	humiliation	honor, pride
Est 9:22	As the days on which the Jews got relief from their enemies, and as the month that had been turned for them from sorrow into gladness and from mourning into a holiday.	threat, death, despoilment	peace, life, property
Ps 13:1–2	Will you forget me forever? How long will you hide your face from me? How long must I take counsel in my soul and have sorrow in my heart all the day? How long shall my enemy be exalted over me?	abandonment, oppression	divine attention, peace
Ps 31:10	For my life is spent with sorrow , and my years with sighing ; my strength fails because of my iniquity, and my bones waste away.	waste, weakness, guilt, illness	productivity, strength, righteousness, health
Ps 41:3	The LORD sustains him on his sickbed ; in his illness you restore him to full health.	illness	health
Ps 42:5, 11 cf. 43:5	Why are you cast down , O my soul, and why are you in turmoil within me? Hope in God; for I shall again praise him, my salvation.	dejection, anxiety	sense of favor, peace
Ps 55:2–4	Attend to me, and answer me; I am restless in my complaint and I moan , because of the noise of the enemy, because of the oppression of the wicked. For they drop trouble upon me, and in anger they bear a grudge against me. My heart is in anguish within me; the terrors of death have fallen upon me.	abandonment, fear, oppression, death	divine answer, peace, rest, life
Ps 69:20	Reproaches have broken my heart , so that I am in despair . I looked for pity, but there was none, and for comforters, but I found none.	social attacks, pitilessness	social favor, pity
Ps 88:9–10	My eye grows dim through sorrow . Every day I call upon you, O LORD; I spread out my hands to you. Do you work wonders for the dead? Do the departed rise up to praise you?	weakness, rejection	health, divine favor
Ps 107:38–39	By his blessing they multiply greatly, and he does not let their livestock diminish. When they are diminished and brought low through oppression, evil, and sorrow .	decreased wealth, oppression	property, peace

Ps 116:3	The snares of death encompassed me; the pangs of Sheol laid hold on me; I suffered distress and anguish .	death	life
Ps 119:28	My soul melts away for sorrow ; strengthen me according to your word!	unspecified	unspecified
Ps. 127:2	It is in vain that you rise up early and go late to rest, eating the bread of anxious toil ; for he gives to his beloved sleep.	toil, hardship	peace, rest
Prv 10:1	The proverbs of Solomon. A wise son makes a glad father, but a foolish son is a sorrow to his mother.	generalized	generalized
Prv 14:10	The heart knows its own bitterness , and no stranger shares its joy.	unspecified	unspecified
Prv 14:13	Even in laughter the heart may ache , and the end of joy may be grief .	unspecified	unspecified
Prv 15:3	A glad heart makes a cheerful face, but by sorrow of heart the spirit is crushed.	unspecified	unspecified
Prv 17:21 cf. 17:25	He who sires a fool gets himself sorrow , and the father of a fool has no joy.	dishonor, shame	respectable, child
Prv 17:22	A joyful heart is good medicine, but a crushed spirit dries up the bones.	unspecified	unspecified
Prv 25:20	Whoever sings songs to a heavy heart is like one who takes off a garment on a cold day, and like vinegar on soda.	unspecified	unspecified
Prv 31:6	Give strong drink to the one who is perishing , and wine to those in bitter distress .	poverty, misery	resources, strength
Ecl 1:18	For in much wisdom is much vexation , and he who increases knowledge increases sorrow .	knowledge	simplicity
Ecl 2:22–23	What has a man from all the toil and striving of heart with which he toils beneath the sun? For all his days are full of sorrow , and his work is a vexation . Even in the night his heart does not rest. This also is vanity.	toil	rest
Ecl 7:2–3	It is better to go to the house of mourning than to go to the house of feasting, for this is the end of all mankind, and the living will lay it to heart. Sorrow is better than laughter, for by sadness of face the heart is made glad.	death	life
Is 1:5	Why will you still be struck down? Why will you continue to rebel? The whole head is sick, and the whole heart faint .	sickness, weakness	health, strength
Is 8:21	They will pass through the land, greatly distressed and hungry.	desolation, hunger	prosperity
Is 15:2	He has gone up to the temple, and to Dibon, to the high places to weep ; over Nebo and over Medeba Moab wails .	desolation, destruction, humiliation	prosperity, strength, glory
Is 19:10	Those who are the pillars of the land will be crushed , and all who work for pay will be grieved .	usurpation and slavery	finances
Is 35:10 cf. Is 51:11	They shall obtain gladness and joy, and sorrow and sighing shall flee away.	weakness, sickness, aridness, wild beasts	strength, health, fertility, safety
Is 53:2–5	For he grew up before him like a young plant, and like a root out of dry ground; he had no form or majesty that we should look at him, and no beauty that we should desire him. He was despised and rejected by men, a man of sorrows and acquainted with grief ; and as one from whom men hide their faces he was despised, and we esteemed him not. Surely he has borne our griefs and carried	dishonor, rejection, ostracism, injustice, torture, death, carrying sin	honor, exaltation, social connection, ease, life,

	our sorrows ; yet we esteemed him stricken, smitten by God, and afflicted. But he was pierced for our transgressions; he was crushed for our iniquities; upon him was the chastisement that brought us peace, and with his wounds we are healed.		living in purity
Jer 8:18	My joy is gone; grief is upon me; my heart is sick within me.	destruction, dishonor	prosperity, honor
Jer 20:18	Why did I come out from the womb to see toil and sorrow , and spend my days in shame?	toil, shame	rest, nonexistence
Jer 45:3	You said, ‘Woe is me! For the LORD has added sorrow to my pain . I am weary with my groaning , and I find no rest.’	maltreatment, reproach, weariness	honor, rest
Jer 49:24	Damascus has become feeble, she turned to flee, and panic seized her; anguish and sorrows have taken hold of her, as of a woman in labor.	weakness, fear, destruction	strength, confidence, prosperity
Lam 1:22	“Let all their evildoing come before you, and deal with them as you have dealt with me because of all my transgressions; for my groans are many, and my heart is faint .”	injustice	justice
Dn 6:14	Then the king, when he heard these words, was much distressed and set his mind to deliver Daniel. And he labored till the sun went down to rescue him.	injustice, inability to rescue	justice
Jon 4:1	But it displeased Jonah exceedingly, and he was angry.	miffed sense of justice and revenge	destruction of enemies forestalled
Jon 4:9	But God said to Jonah, “Do you do well to be angry for the plant?” And he said, “Yes, I do well to be angry , angry enough to die.”	scorching sun	comfort, shade, ease
Mt 17:22–23	As they were gathering in Galilee, Jesus said to them, “The Son of Man is about to be delivered into the hands of men, and they will kill him, and he will be raised on the third day.” And they were greatly distressed .	deprivation, confusion	social connections, Messiah’s presence
Mt 18:31	When his fellow servants saw what had taken place, they were greatly distressed , and they went and reported to their master all that had taken place.	injustice, cruelty	justice, kindness, mercy
Mt 19:22	When the young man heard this he went away sorrowful , for he had great possessions.	divestment of wealth	wealth
Mt 26:22	And they were very sorrowful and began to say to him one after another, “Is it I, Lord?”	betrayal	loyalty
Mt 26:37–38	And taking with him Peter and the two sons of Zebedee, he began to be sorrowful and troubled . Then he said to them, “My soul is very sorrowful , even to death; remain here, and watch with me.”	relational rift, bearing sin, death	filial affection, purity, life
Mk 3:5	And he looked around at them with anger, grieved at their hardness of heart, and said to the man, “Stretch out your hand.” He stretched it out, and his hand was restored.	injustice, hardness of heart	justice, responsiveness
Jn 16:6	But because I have said these things to you, sorrow has filled your heart.	deprivation of fellowship	presence of a friend
Jn 16:20–22	Truly, truly, I say to you, you will weep and lament , but the world will rejoice. You will be sorrowful , but your sorrow will turn into joy. When a woman is giving birth, she has sorrow because her hour has come, but when she has delivered the baby, she no longer remembers the anguish , for joy that a human being has been born	deprivation of fellowship, physical pain	presence of a friend, painlessness

into the world. So also you have **sorrow** now, but I will see you again, and your hearts will rejoice, and no one will take your joy from you.

Jn 21:17	He said to him the third time, “Simon, son of John, do you love me?” Peter was grieved because he said to him the third time, “Do you love me?” and he said to him, “Lord, you know everything; you know that I love you.”	repeated questioning	loyalty
Acts 20:37–38	And there was much weeping on the part of all; they embraced Paul and kissed him, being sorrowful most of all because of the word he had spoken, that they would not see his face again. And they accompanied him to the ship.	deprivation of fellowship	presence of a friend
Rom 9:2	I have great sorrow and unceasing anguish in my heart.	people dying w/o Christ	peace, joy, confidence
Rom 14:15	For if your brother is grieved by what you eat, you are no longer walking in love. By what you eat, do not destroy the one for whom Christ died.	unease, sense of wrong, offense	harmony
2 Cor 2:1–5	For I made up my mind not to make another painful visit to you. For if I cause you pain , who is there to make me glad but the one whom I have pained ? And I wrote as I did, so that when I came I might not suffer pain from those who should have made me rejoice, for I felt sure of all of you, that my joy would be the joy of you all. For I wrote to you out of much affliction and anguish of heart and with many tears , not to cause you pain but to let you know the abundant love that I have for you. Now if anyone has caused pain , he has caused it not to me, but in some measure-- not to put it too severely—to all of you.	harsh words, sins, loss of respect, uncertainty, unrequited love	gentleness, purity, respect, certainty, love
2 Cor 2:7	So you should rather turn to forgive and comfort him, or he may be overwhelmed by excessive sorrow .	ostracism	harmony, fellowship
Eph 4:30	And do not grieve the Holy Spirit of God	sin	purity
Phil 2:27	Indeed he was ill, near to death. But God had mercy on him, and not only on him but on me also, lest I should have sorrow upon sorrow .	death of friend	presence of friend
1 Thes 4:13	But we do not want you to be uninformed, brothers, about those who are asleep, that you may not grieve as others do who have no hope.	death, hopelessness	life, hope
1 Pt 1:6	In this you rejoice, though now for a little while, if necessary, you have been grieved by various trials.	trials, testing	tranquility, ease

Avenues for Application

A biblical-theological look at human melancholy trains our responses to the pain that is around and within us. First, the Church should strive to exercise great tenderness in handling cases of melancholy. As Job’s example demonstrates, friends may assume that a person’s distress must be causally connected with his own specific sins. In Job’s case, his friends were entirely wrong. But since they were wrong, then it would be unbiblical to conclude that Job’s sorrow that resulted from his losses was sinful. In four full chapters of God’s reconfiguring Job’s thinking (Job 38–41), God never rebukes Job’s depression. Job’s error lay in his “speaking without knowledge” about the way things

ought to be in the world and with God. He entered into the realm of sovereignty and providence and spoke untruth. Job's complaint was not untrue regarding the reality of personal losses or the spirituality of a prolonged emotional response to that loss. Rather, his error lay in his challenging the right or authority of God to do as he pleases with his creatures in the process of accomplishing divine purposes and providence. As Layton Talbert observes, Job's grief remained intact (however briefly) even once his relationship with God was restored.³⁸ Therefore, his profound grief was not treated by God as sinful.

Assuming that severe sadness is automatically and inevitably a reflection of specific sin makes no more sense (and is potentially no more accurate) than assuming that a man born blind must have sinned (Jn 9:2–3).³⁹ Jesus swiftly corrected this misguided thinking on the part of his disciples. By itself, melancholy is a reflection of loss—a loss that has actually occurred because of the Fall. Of course sin can attend any emotional state. Happiness can result in drunken carousing (1 Pt 4:2–3) just as sadness can give way to despair (1 Sm 31:3–4). Wholeness and wellbeing can lead to passivity and self-satisfaction (2 Kgs 20:16–19) just as anger can produce violent outbursts (Ex 2:12, Nm 20:10–11). Sin must be diagnosed independently of emotions.

Second, Scripture addresses the full range of melancholic emotions by depicting them as part of normal human experience under the curse. Job and the Psalms, in particular, provide rich resources to guide our nearly unutterable cries so that we do not cross over into despair in the midst of depressive emotions.⁴⁰ The Psalms invite the present-day sufferer to join in a prayer of outright anguish.⁴¹ These texts do not pull punches in describing melancholy in terms of darkness, pain, and death. They also do not rebuke the sufferer who retains faith in the Lord while walking through the “pit,” “Sheol,” “deep darkness,” and “deep distress.” Like every other emotion, melancholy reveals what we value, love, and believe, but it does not have to be antithetic to faith.⁴² By recognizing that God designed our emotions in such a way that melancholy actively mirrors the Fall, the sufferer may wield it as a tool to affirm how badly he feels without succumbing to the imprisoning assessment that melancholy is a disease that has no useful function. The Psalms view depressive emotions as impetus and warrant for confessing how badly we hurt, how dark this world really is, and, therefore, how desperate and vital our faith really is. A faith that clings to God with eyes wide open to the realities of sin, sorrow, and suffering is, frankly, superior to a faith that knows nothing of sorrow. A life without sorrow says, “Life is good, and I trust God,” but a life punctuated with melancholy says, “Though he slay me (and it is a very real possibility under the Fall), I will hope in him” (Job 13:15). There is genuine value in experiencing melancholy that a non-sufferer never enjoys.

³⁸ Layton Talbert, *Beyond Suffering: Discovering the Message of Job* (Greenville, SC: Bob Jones University Press, 2007), 250–251.

³⁹ David Murray, *Christians Get Depressed Too: Hope and Help for Depressed People* (Grand Rapids: Reformation Heritage, 2010), 63–65.

⁴⁰ See the Appendix, which captures the six Psalms most clearly expressive of melancholy (and there are others).

⁴¹ “What implication does God’s manner of using metaphor have for us? You and I need a language of sorrows and God teaches it to us. . . . When we look to the language of God given in the Bible, we find within it a language that the miserable would recognize as native and not foreign to the geography of their inward anguish. We begin gradually to speak and to refrain from speaking as those who know this terrain of anguish first hand. When such speaking takes place, realistic hope has a chance” (Eswine, 70–71).

⁴² Groves and Smith, 39.

Third, while melancholy “tells the truth” about the Fall, it does not tell “the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.” It is a genuine mirror of reality, but it is also a defective mirror because it shows only part of the picture. It does no good to contradict the melancholic, “It’s not that bad,” while he correctly and accurately replies in heart, “Oh, yes, it is!” (and he proves to be right and the counselor proves to be foolish); it also does no good to transfix oneself in the misery of one truth while neglecting the hope of other truths.⁴³ The mirror of our emotions may be both correct and incorrect in different ways simultaneously.

Affirming with the sufferer that life *is* as dark as he feels it to be, this world *is* as corrupt as he feels it to be, and the body, mind, and emotions *are* indeed crumbling can exhibit much needed sympathy.⁴⁴ This is not the *only* truth or *all* the truth, but it is the truth. It can be constructive, then, to recognize the full depth and rightness of sadness while guiding the severely discouraged person to reaffirm “the whole truth.” Recognizing that melancholy mirrors the Fall gives the biblical counselor the opportunity to affirm the decay that has touched everything in this world while insisting that the sufferer also see and confess the restoration that Christ has begun and will continue to eternity. We must not minimize the former in the rush to the latter, or we will seem disingenuous to the sufferer.

As counselors, we can help the sufferer remember that the people of God rest on him and voice a reliance on him even when they cannot see or feel him. Often, pain remains. There is no guarantee that God will deliver us from sadness of heart this side of the Fall any more than he guarantees deliverance from disease and death.⁴⁵ But though the pain remains, it can become like the pain of childbirth—giving rise to something of value, purposeful, God-designed—for that is his plan in all our suffering (Jas 1:12).⁴⁶

For the people of God, the Fall will come to an end, swept away in a majestic display of divine power, wisdom, and compassion involving the redemption and glorification of our bodies, the creation of the new heavens and new earth, and the end of sorrow forever. Melancholy, that eminent emotional mirror of the Fall, will be forever shattered. We will never again know loss, for God will be with us.

⁴³ “Real grief is not easily comforted. It comes like ocean waves rushing up the sand, subsiding back, only to roll in again. These waves vary in size, frequency, and intensity.” James W. Bruce III, *From Grief to Glory: Spiritual Journeys of Mourning Parents* (Wheaton: Crossway, 2002), 56.

⁴⁴ “It was the most rational thing in the world for Elijah to be sick at heart and to desire to die.’ His miseries were not illusory but real. His wish for death did not reveal his insanity but demonstrated the opposite.” Charles Haddon Spurgeon, “Faintness and Refreshing,” *MTP*, vol. 54 (Ages Digital Library), 588.

⁴⁵ “I am sure that I have run more swiftly with a lame leg than I ever did with a sound one. I am certain that I have seen more in the dark than ever I saw in the light,—more stars, most certainly,—more things in heaven if fewer things on earth. The anvil, the fire, and the hammer, are the making of us; we do not get fashioned much by anything else. That heavy hammer falling on us helps to shape us; therefore let affliction and trouble and trial come.” Eric W. Hayden, *Searchlight on Spurgeon: Spurgeon Speaks for Himself* (Pasadena: Pilgrim Publications, 1973), 178.

⁴⁶ Eswine lists benefits that accrue from suffering that are difficult to be gained any other way: *Sorrows deepen our intimacy with God* (139). “*Sorrows enable us to better receive blessings*” (140). “*Sorrows shed our pretenses*” (140). “*Sorrow exposes and roots out our pride*” (141). “*Sorrow teaches us empathy for one another*” (141). “*Sorrows allow small kindnesses to loom large*” (141). “*Sorrows teach us courage for others who face trials*” (141).

C. S. Lewis famously observed, “God whispers to us in our pleasures, speaks in our conscience, but shouts in our pains; it is His megaphone to rouse a deaf world.” *The Problem of Pain* (New York: Macmillan, 1944), 91.

And I heard a loud voice from the throne saying,
“Behold, the dwelling place of God is with man.
He will dwell with them, and they will be his people,
and God himself will be with them as their God.
He will wipe away every tear from their eyes,
and death shall be no more, neither shall there be mourning, nor crying, nor pain anymore,
for the former things have passed away.” (Rev. 21:3–4)

Appendix: ESV Text of Key Psalms on Depression

Psalm 6 (David)

1 O LORD, rebuke me not in your anger, nor discipline me in your wrath.
2 Be gracious to me, O LORD, for I am languishing; heal me, O LORD, for my bones are troubled.
3 My soul also is greatly troubled. But you, O LORD-- how long?
4 Turn, O LORD, deliver my life; save me for the sake of your steadfast love.
5 For in death there is no remembrance of you; in Sheol who will give you praise?
6 I am weary with my moaning; every night I flood my bed with tears; I drench my couch with my weeping.
7 My eye wastes away because of grief; it grows weak because of all my foes.
8 Depart from me, all you workers of evil, for the LORD has heard the sound of my weeping.
9 The LORD has heard my plea; the LORD accepts my prayer.
10 All my enemies shall be ashamed and greatly troubled; they shall turn back and be put to shame in a moment.

Psalm 13 (David)

1 How long, O LORD? Will you forget me forever? How long will you hide your face from me?
2 How long must I take counsel in my soul and have sorrow in my heart all the day? How long shall my enemy be exalted over me?
3 Consider and answer me, O LORD my God; light up my eyes, lest I sleep the sleep of death,
4 lest my enemy say, "I have prevailed over him," lest my foes rejoice because I am shaken.
5 But I have trusted in your steadfast love; my heart shall rejoice in your salvation.
6 I will sing to the LORD, because he has dealt bountifully with me.

Psalm 38 (David)

1 O LORD, rebuke me not in your anger, nor discipline me in your wrath!
2 For your arrows have sunk into me, and your hand has come down on me.
3 There is no soundness in my flesh because of your indignation; there is no health in my bones because of my sin.
4 For my iniquities have gone over my head; like a heavy burden, they are too heavy for me.
5 My wounds stink and fester because of my foolishness,
6 I am utterly bowed down and prostrate; all the day I go about mourning.
7 For my sides are filled with burning, and there is no soundness in my flesh.
8 I am feeble and crushed; I groan because of the tumult of my heart.
9 O Lord, all my longing is before you; my sighing is not hidden from you.
10 My heart throbs; my strength fails me, and the light of my eyes-- it also has gone from me.
11 My friends and companions stand aloof from my plague, and my nearest kin stand far off.
12 Those who seek my life lay their snares; those who seek my hurt speak of ruin and meditate treachery all day long.
13 But I am like a deaf man; I do not hear, like a mute man who does not open his mouth.
14 I have become like a man who does not hear, and in whose mouth are no rebukes.
15 But for you, O LORD, do I wait; it is you, O Lord my God, who will answer.
16 For I said, "Only let them not rejoice over me, who boast against me when my foot slips!"
17 For I am ready to fall, and my pain is ever before me.
18 I confess my iniquity; I am sorry for my sin.
19 But my foes are vigorous, they are mighty, and many are those who hate me wrongfully.

<p>20 Those who render me evil for good accuse me because I follow after good.</p> <p>21 Do not forsake me, O LORD! O my God, be not far from me!</p> <p>22 Make haste to help me, O Lord, my salvation!</p>
<p>Psalm 77 (Asaph)</p> <p>1 I cry aloud to God, aloud to God, and he will hear me.</p> <p>2 In the day of my trouble I seek the Lord; in the night my hand is stretched out without wearying; my soul refuses to be comforted.</p> <p>3 When I remember God, I moan; when I meditate, my spirit faints. Selah</p> <p>4 You hold my eyelids open; I am so troubled that I cannot speak.</p> <p>5 I consider the days of old, the years long ago.</p> <p>6 I said, "Let me remember my song in the night; let me meditate in my heart." Then my spirit made a diligent search:</p> <p>7 "Will the Lord spurn forever, and never again be favorable?</p> <p>8 Has his steadfast love forever ceased? Are his promises at an end for all time?</p> <p>9 Has God forgotten to be gracious? Has he in anger shut up his compassion?" Selah.</p> <p>10 Then I said, "I will appeal to this, to the years of the right hand of the Most High."</p> <p>11 I will remember the deeds of the LORD; yes, I will remember your wonders of old.</p> <p>12 I will ponder all your work, and meditate on your mighty deeds.</p> <p>13 Your way, O God, is holy. What god is great like our God?</p> <p>14 You are the God who works wonders; you have made known your might among the peoples.</p> <p>15 You with your arm redeemed your people, the children of Jacob and Joseph. Selah</p> <p>16 When the waters saw you, O God, when the waters saw you, they were afraid; indeed, the deep trembled.</p> <p>17 The clouds poured out water; the skies gave forth thunder; your arrows flashed on every side.</p> <p>18 The crash of your thunder was in the whirlwind; your lightnings lighted up the world; the earth trembled and shook.</p> <p>19 Your way was through the sea, your path through the great waters; yet your footprints were unseen.</p> <p>20 You led your people like a flock by the hand of Moses and Aaron.</p>
<p>Psalm 88 (Heman)</p> <p>1 O LORD, God of my salvation, I cry out day and night before you.</p> <p>2 Let my prayer come before you; incline your ear to my cry!</p> <p>3 For my soul is full of troubles, and my life draws near to Sheol.</p> <p>4 I am counted among those who go down to the pit; I am a man who has no strength,</p> <p>5 like one set loose among the dead, like the slain that lie in the grave, like those whom you remember no more, for they are cut off from your hand.</p> <p>6 You have put me in the depths of the pit, in the regions dark and deep.</p> <p>7 Your wrath lies heavy upon me, and you overwhelm me with all your waves. Selah</p> <p>8 You have caused my companions to shun me; you have made me a horror to them. I am shut in so that I cannot escape;</p> <p>9 my eye grows dim through sorrow. Every day I call upon you, O LORD; I spread out my hands to you.</p> <p>10 Do you work wonders for the dead? Do the departed rise up to praise you? Selah</p> <p>11 Is your steadfast love declared in the grave, or your faithfulness in Abaddon?</p> <p>12 Are your wonders known in the darkness, or your righteousness in the land of forgetfulness?</p> <p>13 But I, O LORD, cry to you; in the morning my prayer comes before you.</p> <p>14 O LORD, why do you cast my soul away? Why do you hide your face from me?</p>

15 Afflicted and close to death from my youth up, I suffer your terrors; I am helpless.
16 Your wrath has swept over me; your dreadful assaults destroy me.
17 They surround me like a flood all day long; they close in on me together.
18 You have caused my beloved and my friend to shun me; my companions have become darkness.

Psalm 102 (Unknown author)

1 Hear my prayer, O LORD; let my cry come to you!
2 Do not hide your face from me in the day of my distress! Incline your ear to me; answer me speedily in the day when I call!
3 For my days pass away like smoke, and my bones burn like a furnace.
4 My heart is struck down like grass and has withered; I forget to eat my bread.
5 Because of my loud groaning my bones cling to my flesh.
6 I am like a desert owl of the wilderness, like an owl of the waste places;
7 I lie awake; I am like a lonely sparrow on the housetop.
8 All the day my enemies taunt me; those who deride me use my name for a curse.
9 For I eat ashes like bread and mingle tears with my drink,
10 because of your indignation and anger; for you have taken me up and thrown me down.
11 My days are like an evening shadow; I wither away like grass.
12 But you, O LORD, are enthroned forever; you are remembered throughout all generations.
13 You will arise and have pity on Zion; it is the time to favor her; the appointed time has come.
14 For your servants hold her stones dear and have pity on her dust.
15 Nations will fear the name of the LORD, and all the kings of the earth will fear your glory.
16 For the LORD builds up Zion; he appears in his glory;
17 he regards the prayer of the destitute and does not despise their prayer.
18 Let this be recorded for a generation to come, so that a people yet to be created may praise the LORD:
19 that he looked down from his holy height; from heaven the LORD looked at the earth,
20 to hear the groans of the prisoners, to set free those who were doomed to die,
21 that they may declare in Zion the name of the LORD, and in Jerusalem his praise,
22 when peoples gather together, and kingdoms, to worship the LORD.
23 He has broken my strength in midcourse; he has shortened my days.
24 "O my God," I say, "take me not away in the midst of my days-- you whose years endure throughout all generations!"
25 Of old you laid the foundation of the earth, and the heavens are the work of your hands.
26 They will perish, but you will remain; they will all wear out like a garment. You will change them like a robe, and they will pass away,
27 but you are the same, and your years have no end.
28 The children of your servants shall dwell secure; their offspring shall be established before you.

Bibliography

- Anderson, Neil T. and Joanne Anderson. *Overcoming Depression*. Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 2004.
- Begdache, Lina. "Ask a Scientist: Neurons Help Explain How Our Brains Think." *PressConnects* March 27, 2019. Accessed 18 July 2023, <https://www.pressconnects.com/story/news/local/2019/03/18/ask-scientist-how-do-thoughts-work-our-brain/3153303002/>.
- Benson, George A. *What To Do When You're Depressed: A Christian Psychoanalyst Helps You Understand and Overcome Your Depression*. Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1975.
- Berg, Richard F. and Christine McCartney. *Depression and the Integrated Life: A Christian Understanding of Sadness and Inner Suffering*. New York: Alba House, 1981.
- Bernstein, Peter L. *Against the Gods: The Remarkable Story of Risk*. New York: Wiley, 1998.
- Calvert, Bud. *Emotional Victory: How to Deal with How You Feel*. Lancaster, CA: Striving Together Publications, 2012.
- Eswine, Zack. *Spurgeon's Sorrows: Realistic Hope for Those Who Suffer from Depression*. Glasgow: Bell and Bain, 2014.
- First, M. B. ed. *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorder*, 4th ed. Washington, D.C.: American Psychiatric Association, 1994.
- Geisler, Norman L. *Systematic Theology in One Volume*. Minneapolis: Bethany House, 2011.
- Greene, Judson D. "At the Left Hand of the Son: God the Father's Spatial Manifestation in Heaven." Unpublished MA thesis: BJU Seminary, 2020.
- Groves, J. Alasdair and Winston T. Smith. *Untangling Emotions*. Wheaton: Crossway, 2019.
- Grudem, Wayne. *Systematic Theology*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1994.
- Hayden, Eric W. *Searchlight on Spurgeon: Spurgeon Speaks for Himself*. Pasadena: Pilgrim Publications, 1973.
- Hodges, Charles D. *Good Mood Bad Mood: Help and Hope for Depression and Bipolar Disorder*. Wapwallopen, PA: Shepherd Press, 2012.
- Horton, Ronald. *Mood Tides: Divine Purpose in the Rhythms of Life*. Greenville, SC: JourneyForth, 2008.

- Johnson, Thomas Cary. *The Life and Letters of Robert Lewis Dabney*. 1903; reprint, Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1977.
- Kinnaman, Gary and Richard Jacobs. *Seeking in the Dark: Getting the Facts on Depression & Finding Hope Again*. Minneapolis: Bethany House, 2006.
- Lewis, C. S. *The Problem of Pain*. New York: Macmillan, 1944.
- “Major Depression.” National Institute of Mental Health. Accessed 5 July 2023, <https://www.nimh.nih.gov/health/statistics/major-depression>.
- McCune, Rolland. *A Systematic Theology of Biblical Christianity*, vol. 2. Detroit: Detroit Baptist Theological Seminary, 2009.
- Meier, Paul. *Blue Genes: Breaking Free from the Chemical Imbalances That Affect Your Moods, Your Mind, Your Life, and Your Loved Ones*. Carol Stream, IL: Tyndale, 2005.
- Murray, David. *Christians Get Depressed Too: Hope and Help for Depressed People*. Grand Rapids: Reformation Heritage, 2010.
- Piper, John. *When the Darkness Will Not Lift: Doing What We Can While We Wait for God—and Joy*. Wheaton: Crossway, 2006.
- Spurgeon, Charles Haddon. “Faintness and Refreshing.” *MTP*, vol. 54. Ages Digital Library.
- Talbert, Layton. *Beyond Suffering: Discovering the Message of Job*. Greenville, SC: Bob Jones University Press, 2007.
- Trahan, Carol. *Help! I Am Depressed*. Leominster: Day One Publications, 2012.
- Truschel, Jessica. “Depression Definition and DSM-5 Diagnostic Criteria.” Reviewed by Farah Fazel. Accessed 30 June 2023. www.psychom.net/depression/major-despressive-disorder/dsm-5-depression-criteria.
- Welch, Edward T. *Depression A Stubborn Darkness: Light for the Path*. Winston-Salem: Punch Press, 2004.
- “What Is Depression?” Reviewed by Felix Torres. American Psychiatric Association. Accessed 30 June 2023, www.psychiatry.org/patients-families/depression/what-is-depression.